

APPENDIX D

YMCA and Forsyth County Responses to Comments

Sumner, Lewis C SAM

From: Sumner, Lewis C SAM
Sent: Thursday, April 10, 2008 11:27 AM
To: 'DanP@ymcaatlanta.org'
Cc: Day, Kenneth SAM; Hadden, G Keith SAM; Davis, Jonathan A SAM; Givhan, Joseph P Jr SAM; Feldmeier, Paula M SAM; Shoemake, Deborah J SAM; Bradley, Kenneth P SAM; Flakes, Curtis M SAM; Fuller, William W SAM; Lapina, Michael B SAM; Stone, Darrell R SAM; Janusheske, Wanda H SAM; Robbins, Ervin P SAM; Coghlan, Lisa A SAM; Jorns, Byron G COL SAM
Subject: Comments re: Bethel Park

Mr. Dan Pile
Group Vice President
Metropolitan Atlanta YMCA, Inc.
100 Edgewood Avenue N.E.
Suite 1100
Atlanta, Georgia

Dear Mr. Pile:

This is in regard to our evaluation of development proposals submitted by the Metropolitan Atlanta YMCA, Inc. for a lease award of Bethel Park at Lake Sidney Lanier. As you are aware we have prepared a Draft Environmental Assessment (EA) to evaluate the environmental impacts of the proposed lease to a non-Federal entity. As part of our evaluation, we allowed the public to review and comment on the Draft EA. In response, we received approximately 5,000 comments. Some of the comments received raised issues that are specific either to the YMCA Proposal or to Forsyth County, which as you know, has also made a lease application and development proposal for the property. Other issues raised could apply equally to any proposed lessee. For those issues where current information is not adequate, each applicant is being asked to address a list of items and to provide additional information as appropriate. For the YMCA proposal, I request that you address the following issues:

a. A local church uses Bethel Park as a place of baptism and opposes any proposed change that would prevent their members from continuing its use. Would your plan allow continued use by the church, and if so, how would it be organized to minimize potential competing uses of facilities?

b. A concern was raised by some commenters that traffic studies do not take into account projected population growth in the area, which they say is expected to double by the year 2030. Likewise, they claim the study does not take into account the opening of a new high school in the area with its associated traffic. Please respond, describing how the results of your traffic study would be affected by such development.

c. A concern was raised that an additional number of children, compared to current numbers, would be using swimming areas in the same area where speed boats frequently pass, subjecting them to a safety hazard. Please describe how safety would be maintained, given large numbers of children that could potentially be affected.

d. Some commenters have provided photographs of long lines and traffic jams that occurred at other Camp High Harbors while parents parked and waited for YMCA to open on drop-off day. Please address the comment, describing how you would prevent the problem from occurring. Note that the issue is somewhat different from other traffic concerns, since the problem relates more to parked vehicles blocking the roadway, than to the number of vehicles using the road over a period of time.

e. A concern was raised that your proposed sewage treatment plan will not meet Forsyth County requirements. Please describe how you will comply with the County law and/or regulation.

f. A commenter stated that bright lights used by the YMCA at night constitute a nighttime nuisance to the nearby neighborhood. Describe how you would manage this impact.

g. A comment was received that the noise study was inadequate; that playing loud rock music did not constitute a scientific study. Please describe the methodology of the study relative to its professional acceptance as a bona fide noise study.

h. A concern was raised as to the restriction in use of the park to the general public, specifically to the use of the boat ramp and walking trails - that even with allowing times for the public to have access to the facilities, there would be conflicts between overlapping camper arrivals and public use.

In order for us to continue timely processing of the EA, please provide your response by April 24, 2008. Please contact me if you have any questions regarding this request. You may reach me at this e-mail address or by telephone at (251) 694-3857. Thank you.

Chuck Sumner
Inland Environment Team
Planning Divison
Mobile District, U.S. Army Corps of Engineers

Sumner, Lewis C SAM

From: Sumner, Lewis C SAM
Sent: Thursday, April 10, 2008 11:22 AM
To: 'Jerry Kinsey (jkinsey@forsythco.com)'
Cc: Day, Kenneth SAM; Hadden, G Keith SAM; Davis, Jonathan A SAM; Givhan, Joseph P Jr SAM; Feldmeier, Paula M SAM; Shoemake, Deborah J SAM; Bradley, Kenneth P SAM; Flakes, Curtis M SAM; Fuller, William W SAM; Lapina, Michael B SAM; Stone, Darrell R SAM; Janusheske, Wanda H SAM; Robbins, Ervin P SAM; Coghlan, Lisa A SAM; Jorns, Byron G COL SAM
Subject: Comments re: Bethel Park
Contacts: Jerry Kinsey

Mr. Jerry Kinsey
Director of Parks and Recreation
Forsyth County, Georgia

Dear Mr. Kinsey:

This is in regard to our evaluation of development proposals submitted by Forsyth County for a lease award of Bethel Park at Lake Sidney Lanier. As you are aware we have prepared a Draft Environmental Assessment (EA) to evaluate the environmental impacts of the proposed lease to a non-Federal entity. As part of our evaluation, we allowed the public to review and comment on the Draft EA. In response, we received approximately 5,000 comments. Some of the comments received raised issues that are specific either to the Forsyth County Proposal or to the YMCA, which as you know, has also made a lease application and development proposal for the property. Other issues raised could apply equally to any proposed lessee. For those issues where current information is not adequate, each applicant is being asked to address a list of items and to provide additional information as appropriate. For the Forsyth County proposal, I request that you address the following issues:

a. A local church uses Bethel Park as a place of baptism and opposes any proposed change that would prevent their members from continuing its use. Would your plan allow continued use by the church, and if so, how would it be organized to minimize potential competing uses of facilities?

b. A concern was raised by some commenters that traffic studies do not take into account projected population growth in the area, which they say is expected to double by the year 2030. Likewise, they claim the study does not take into account the opening of a new high school in the area with its associated traffic. Please respond, describing how the results of your traffic study would be affected by such development.

c. A concern was raised that an additional number of children would be using swimming areas in the same area where speed boats frequently pass, subjecting them to a safety hazard.

In order for us to continue timely processing of the EA, please provide your response by April 24, 2008. Please contact me if you have any questions regarding this request. You may reach me at this e-mail address or by telephone at (251) 694-3857. Thank you.

Chuck Sumner
Inland Environment Team
Planning Division
Mobile District, U.S. Army Corps of Engineers

Sumner, Lewis C SAM

From: Bruce, Tommy R. [TRBruce@forsythco.com]
Sent: Monday, April 14, 2008 11:42 AM
To: Sumner, Lewis C SAM
Subject: FW: Comments re: Bethel Park

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Red

From: Kinsey, Jerry L.
Sent: Monday, April 14, 2008 12:25 PM
To: 'Lewis.C.Sumner@usace.mil'
Cc: Bruce, Tommy R.
Subject: FW: Comments re: Bethel Park

Mr. Sumner,

The county will work with the Church and the answer to B and C is below. Please let me know if you need anything else.

THANKS
Jerry Kinsey
Director
Parks and Recreation Department
jkinsey@forsythco.com
770 781 2215 ext.4679

From: Phillips, Charles [mailto:CAPHILLIPS@mactec.com]
Sent: Monday, April 14, 2008 11:24 AM
To: Kinsey, Jerry L.
Subject: RE: Comments re: Bethel Park

Jerry:

Good to hear from you. Hope all is well.

In regards to question A, if the County allows it now at the public beach, why would it not be allowed in the future at the public beach?

Question B is addressed in the report that we provided the Corps. Below is the text that we gave.

Existing Conditions

Bethel Road and Swiss Air Road are both 2 lane, asphalt roads through generally rolling

terrain accessing a relatively sparsely populated residential area with low traffic volumes. Swiss Air Road provides direct access to the proposed Bethel Park area. It intersects with Bethel Road at a TEE intersection, about 2,500 feet, 0.5 miles, from the area of the proposed park entrance. Bethel Road continues northward to a TEE intersection with SR 369, Brown's Bridge Road about 6400 feet, 1.2 miles from the intersection of Swiss Air Road. The existing and projected traffic data was obtained from Forsyth County and is shown on Table T1 below.

Table T1 - Existing and Projected Traffic Data - vpd

Location

2005

2015

2030

Bethel Road

3800

4860

6450

Swiss Air Road (1)

200

220

240

(1) No traffic data available. Traffic data assumed based on existing development

vpd Vehicle per day

Proposed Development - Traffic Projections

The proposed development of Bethel Park will include multiple use areas comprising varied traffic patterns. Due to the nature of the developed park, much of the traffic generated will be during off-peak hours and on weekends, thereby generally having lesser affects to the existing roadway network than during peak hours. The total estimated trips generated due to the proposed park were developed based on the ITE Trip Generation Manual. For this calculation and analysis, we assumed the most severe case and maximum occupancy and use of the park for trips generated. A detailed breakdown of the specific park uses and respective trips generated is included on the attached trip generation calculation. There are no other known planned or programmed projects in the immediate area of the project that will have an impact to this analysis.

As you can see, we accounted for population increases through the year 2030, as projected by Forsyth County. As far as the High School goes, we were unaware of it (see last sentence), so that was not considered in the analysis. We would need to know the size and location of the proposed school to further evaluate what impact it may have on the traffic on the park road. I would think that the school would be doing a traffic study that would identify its' impact on the road.

In regards to question C, we have proposed swimming in designated areas which would be buoyed and roped off from boating traffic.

If you need additional information, please let me know.

Charlie Phillips, ASLA
MACTEC Engineering & Consulting, Inc.

From: Kinsey, Jerry L. [mailto:JLKinsey@forsythco.com]
Sent: Monday, April 14, 2008 10:35 AM
To: rhuffman@mactec.com; Phillips, Charles
Cc: Bruce, Tommy R.; Derrer, Doug E.
Subject: FW: Comments re: Bethel Park

Charlie,

Please provide answers to B and C and I will ask county about A?

THANKS

Jerry Kinsey

Director

Parks and Recreation Department

jlkinsey@forsythco.com

770 781 2215 ext.4679

From: Sumner, Lewis C SAM [mailto:Lewis.C.Sumner@usace.army.mil]
Sent: Thursday, April 10, 2008 12:22 PM
To: Kinsey, Jerry L.
Cc: Day, Kenneth SAM; Hadden, G Keith SAM; Davis, Jonathan A SAM; Givhan, Joseph P Jr SAM; Feldmeier, Paula M SAM; Shoemake, Deborah J SAM; Bradley, Kenneth P SAM; Flakes, Curtis M SAM; Fuller, William W SAM; Lapina, Michael B SAM; Stone, Darrell R SAM; Janusheske, Wanda H SAM; Robbins, Ervin P SAM; Coghlan, Lisa A SAM; Jorns, Byron G COL SAM
Subject: Comments re: Bethel Park

Mr. Jerry Kinsey
Director of Parks and Recreation
Forsyth County, Georgia

Dear Mr. Kinsey:

This is in regard to our evaluation of development proposals submitted by Forsyth County for a lease award of Bethel Park at Lake Sidney Lanier. As you are aware we have prepared a Draft Environmental Assessment (EA) to evaluate the environmental impacts of the proposed lease to a non-Federal entity. As part of our evaluation, we allowed the

public to review and comment on the Draft EA. In response, we received approximately 5,000 comments. Some of the comments received raised issues that are specific either to the Forsyth County Proposal or to the YMCA, which as you know, has also made a lease application and development proposal for the property. Other issues raised could apply equally to any proposed lessee. For those issues where current information is not adequate, each applicant is being asked to address a list of items and to provide additional information as appropriate. For the Forsyth County proposal, I request that you address the following issues:

a. A local church uses Bethel Park as a place of baptism and opposes any proposed change that would prevent their members from continuing its use. Would your plan allow continued use by the church, and if so, how would it be organized to minimize potential competing uses of facilities?

b. A concern was raised by some commenters that traffic studies do not take into account projected population growth in the area, which they say is expected to double by the year 2030. Likewise, they claim the study does not take into account the opening of a new high school in the area with its associated traffic. Please respond, describing how the results of your traffic study would be affected by such development.

c. A concern was raised that an additional number of children would be using swimming areas in the same area where speed boats frequently pass, subjecting them to a safety hazard.

In order for us to continue timely processing of the EA, please provide your response by April 24, 2008. Please contact me if you have any questions regarding this request

You may reach me at this e-mail address or by telephone at (251) 694-3857. Thank you.

Chuck Sumner
Inland Environment Team
Planning Division
Mobile District, U.S. Army Corps of Engineers

Sumner, Lewis C SAM

From: DanP@ymcaatlanta.org
Sent: Thursday, April 24, 2008 3:20 PM
To: Sumner, Lewis C SAM
Cc: DanP@ymcaatlanta.org; Day, Kenneth SAM; Hadden, G Keith SAM; Davis, Jonathan A SAM; Givhan, Joseph P Jr SAM; Feldmeier, Paula M SAM; Shoemake, Deborah J SAM; Bradley, Kenneth P SAM; Flakes, Curtis M SAM; Fuller, William W SAM; Lapina, Michael B SAM; Stone, Darrell R SAM; Janusheske, Wanda H SAM; Robbins, Ervin P SAM; Coghlan, Lisa A SAM; Jorns, Byron G COL SAM; EdM@ymcaatlanta.org; rbanks@banksstubbs.com; Carol@cookerly.com; jjanderson@huronconsultinggroup.com
Subject: YMCA's Response to Questions resulting from the 30 day comment period
Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Red
Attachments: Final 3-24 YMCA Response to 2008 Public Comment Period.doc



Final 3-24 YMCA
Response to 20...

April 24, 2008

Attention: Mr. Chuck Sumner

Inland Environment Team
Planning Division

Mobile District, U.S.Army Corps of Engineers

P.O. Box2288

Mobile , Alabama 36628-0001

Dear Sir,

Regarding the YMCA's intention to lease and develop Bethel Park into a youth camping facility, I am pleased to submit the attached response to the questions and concerns you have identified. We understand these questions and comments result from the recent 30 day public comment period. I am submitting our response by your requested deadline of April 24, 2004.

As you may know, we have maintained a willingness to discuss our plans for a youth camp and family retreat center with the local community and the Corps of Engineers. I sincerely believe we have more than adequately addressed each and that we have demonstrated a sizable effort to meet and address concerns of local residents. It is our contention that a YMCA camp at Bethel Park will not have significant impact on the local community and is a more suitable solution and plan for Bethel Park.

Should you have any questions or need clarification, please give me a call at 77-490-2116. I will continue to be happy to assist you. I would greatly appreciate your acknowledgement of receipt of this transmission.

Sincerely,

Dan Pile
Executive Director
Group Vice President, Metro Atlanta YMCA

-----"Sumner, Lewis C SAM" <Lewis.C.Sumner@usace.army.mil> wrote: -----

To: <DanP@ymcaatlanta.org>
From: "Sumner, Lewis C SAM" <Lewis.C.Sumner@usace.army.mil>
Date: 04/10/2008 12:26PM
cc: "Day, Kenneth SAM" <Kenneth.Day@usace.army.mil>, "Hadden, G Keith SAM" <g.Keith.Hadden@usace.army.mil>, "Davis, Jonathan A SAM" <Jonathan.A.Davis@usace.army.mil>, "Givhan, Joseph P Jr SAM" <Joseph.P.Givhan.Jr@usace.army.mil>, "Feldmeier, Paula M SAM" <Paula.M.Feldmeier2@usace.army.mil>, "Shoemake, Deborah J SAM" <Deborah.J.Shoemake@usace.army.mil>, "Bradley, Kenneth P SAM" <Kenneth.P.Bradley@usace.army.mil>, "Flakes, Curtis M SAM" <Curtis.M.Flakes@usace.army.mil>, "Fuller, William W SAM" <William.W.Fuller@usace.army.mil>, "Lapina, Michael B SAM" <Michael.B.Lapina@usace.army.mil>, "Stone, Darrell R SAM" <Darrell.R.Stone@usace.army.mil>, "Janusheske, Wanda H SAM" <Wanda.H.Janusheske@usace.army.mil>, "Robbins, Ervin P SAM" <Ervin.P.Robbins@usace.army.mil>, "Coghlan, Lisa A SAM" <lisa.a.coghlan@usace.army.mil>, "Jorns, Byron G COL SAM" <Byron.G.Jorns.COL@usace.army.mil>
Subject: Comments re: Bethel Park

Mr. Dan Pile
Group Vice President
Metropolitan Atlanta YMCA, Inc.
100 Edgewood Avenue N.E.
Suite 1100
Atlanta, Georgia

Dear Mr. Pile:

This is in regard to our evaluation of development proposals submitted by the Metropolitan Atlanta YMCA, Inc. for a lease award of Bethel Park at Lake Sidney Lanier. As you are aware we have prepared a Draft Environmental Assessment (EA) to evaluate the environmental impacts of the proposed lease to a non-Federal entity. As part of our evaluation, we allowed the public to review and comment on the Draft EA. In response, we received approximately 5,000 comments. Some of the comments received raised issues that are specific either to the YMCA Proposal or to Forsyth County, which as you know, has also made a lease application and development proposal for the property. Other issues raised could apply equally to any proposed lessee. For those issues where current information is not adequate, each applicant is being asked to address a list of items and to provide additional information as appropriate. For the YMCA proposal, I request that you address the following issues:

a. A local church uses Bethel Park as a place of baptism and opposes any proposed change that would prevent their members from continuing its use. Would your plan allow continued use by the church, and if so, how would it be organized to minimize potential competing uses of facilities?

b. A concern was raised by some commenters that traffic studies do not take

into account projected population growth in the area, which they say is expected to double by the year 2030. Likewise, they claim the study does not take into account the opening of a new high school in the area with its associated traffic. Please respond, describing how the results of your traffic study would be affected by such development.

c. A concern was raised that an additional number of children, compared to current numbers, would be using swimming areas in the same area where speed boats frequently pass, subjecting them to a safety hazard. Please describe how safety would be maintained, given large numbers of children that could potentially be affected.

d. Some commenters have provided photographs of long lines and traffic jams that occurred at other Camp High Harbors while parents parked and waited for YMCA to open on drop-off day. Please address the comment, describing how you would prevent the problem from occurring. Note that the issue is somewhat different from other traffic concerns, since the problem relates more to parked vehicles blocking the roadway, than to the number of vehicles using the road over a period of time.

e. A concern was raised that your proposed sewage treatment plan will not meet Forsyth County requirements. Please describe how you will comply with the County law and/or regulation.

f. A commenter stated that bright lights used by the YMCA at night constitute a nighttime nuisance to the nearby neighborhood. Describe how you would manage this impact.

g. A comment was received that the noise study was inadequate; that playing loud rock music did not constitute a scientific study. Please describe the methodology of the study relative to its professional acceptance as a bona fide noise study.

h. A concern was raised as to the restriction in use of the park to the general public, specifically to the use of the boat ramp and walking trails ? that even with allowing times for the public to have access to the facilities, there would be conflicts between overlapping camper arrivals and public use.

In order for us to continue timely processing of the EA, please provide your response by April 24, 2008. Please contact me if you have any questions regarding this request. You may reach me at this e-mail address or by telephone at (251) 694-3857. Thank you.

Chuck Sumner
Inland Environment Team
Planning Divison
Mobile District, U.S. Army Corps of Engineers



YMCA

**We build strong kids,
strong families, strong communities**

April 24, 2008

Attention: Mr. Chuck Sumner
Inland Environment Team
Planning Division
Mobile District, U.S. Army Corps of Engineers
P.O. Box 2288
Mobile, Alabama 36628-0001

Dear Sir,

Regarding the YMCA's intention to lease and develop Bethel Park into a youth camping facility, I am pleased to submit the attached response to the questions and concerns you have identified. We understand these questions and comments result from the recent 30 day public comment period. I am submitting our response by your requested deadline of April 24, 2004.

As you may know, we have maintained a willingness to discuss our plans for a youth camp and family retreat center with the local community and the Corps of Engineers. I sincerely believe we have more than adequately addressed each concern and that we have demonstrated a sizable effort to meet and address those of local residents. It is our contention that a YMCA camp at Bethel Park will not in any way have a negative impact on the local community and is a more suitable solution and plan for Bethel Park.

Should you have any questions or need clarification, please give me a call at 77-490-2116. I will continue to be happy to assist you.

Sincerely,

Dan Pile
Group Vice President
YMCA of Metro Atlanta, Inc.

YMCA Proposed Youth Camp and Family Retreat Center
Response to Questions and Comments
2008 Public Comment Period
April 24, 2008

Q. A local church uses Bethel Park as a place of baptism and opposes any proposed change that would prevent their members from continuing its use. Would your plan allow continued use by the church, and if so, how would it be organized to minimize potential competing uses of facilities?

A. The YMCA will most certainly allow for Church access and use of lakefront and other amenities for baptisms and functions such as outdoor weddings, retreats etc. In fact an improved property will feature cabins for overnight stays, meeting and dining hall facilities and other amenities. Many churches, non-profit, and civic groups have requested these features during our market and use studies. A YMCA camp at Bethel Park will enrich any religious groups experience should it utilize these features. YMCA's are currently open to Churches and other religious institutions who seek to utilize our aquatic centers for the sacrament of baptism. The YMCA is an organization which embraces its Judeo-Christian heritage. Requests for use of the YMCA facilities must simply be submitted to our camp administrative offices to assure scheduling conflicts will not occur. The YMCA will schedule programs and activities in areas which will not interfere with the sacred atmosphere and privacy appropriate during baptism ceremonies.

Q. A concern was raised by some commenters that traffic studies do not take into account projected population growth in the area, which they say is expected to double by the year 2030. Likewise, they claim the study does not take into account the opening of a new high school in the area with its associated traffic. Please respond, describing how the results of your traffic study would be affected by such development.

A. The traffic study included a 3% per year background growth rate, meaning it was estimated that traffic in the area will increase by 3% per year regardless of the proposed YMCA camp. Standard industry practice for traffic impact studies is to evaluate future traffic based on the full occupancy year of the proposed use which will be 2010. The existing traffic volumes were increased by 3% per year for 3 years to estimate the 2010 traffic volumes prior to the addition of traffic from the proposed camp, which amounts to a more than 9% absolute increase in traffic over 3 years. This growth rate is more than sufficient to account for future traffic increases in the area and this growth rate is consistent with projected population increases in Forsyth County. The trips that will be generated by the proposed camp were then added to the future trips to estimate the total future traffic after full occupancy of the camp in 2010. The total future trips including the projected camp traffic were used in the traffic study to analyze future 2010 traffic operations.

The Forsyth County Board of Education has a new high school planned for development in 2011. This school, currently known as "North Relief," is located off highway 369 and Jot Em Down Road. Hwy 369 is a major highway designed to accommodate heavy commuter traffic and connects Hall and Forsyth County. Hwy 369 is more than adequate to accommodate peak traffic which may occur as a result of a new high school. YMCA traffic projections demonstrate no significant impact on area conditions. A new high school, whether existing or proposed, does not generate traffic on Saturdays or Sundays when the YMCA camp families arrive. It is important to note that Forsyth County Schools are open and generate significant peak traffic from August through May. During this period, very little traffic will result from YMCA programs and

activities. The primary program offered by the YMCA will take place during summer months when schools are on summer recess.

The YMCA Traffic Study was conducted by A&R Engineering, Inc. who also conducts traffic studies for the Forsyth County Board of Education.

Actual traffic study data are available upon request.

Q. A concern was raised that an additional number of children, compared to current numbers, would be using swimming areas in the same area where speed boats frequently pass, subjecting them to a safety hazard. Please describe how safety would be maintained, given the large numbers of children that could potentially be affected.

A. The YMCA carefully designed its camp proposal with safety and risk as a major priority. Actual on-site observations have revealed “no” excessive boat traffic within the cove areas where the YMCA camp programs will take place. Retired Colonel Erwin Topper actually recommended Bethel Park to the YMCA due to its unique location and protected coves which are a considerable distance from the main traffic areas of Lake Lanier. Much of the YMCA swimming and water activities will take place in two locations: 1) an outdoor swim pool; 2) a beach area located well within the protected coves of Bethel Park. To further assure safe conditions, the YMCA will seek to establish a “slow, no wake zone” from the Corps of Engineers and DNR and will fully comply with any and all application procedures deemed appropriate by both entities.

These same concerns have been successfully addressed at YMCA camps located on Lake Allatoona, Lake Burton, and Lake Percy, located in Middle Tennessee. The YMCA is the premier provider of waterfront safety and life guard training throughout the entire nation. All waterfront activities will be carefully monitored and supervised by YMCA certified lifeguards to further assure waterfront safety.

In addition, the YMCA will construct a control tower at the waterfront. The tower will be occupied by camp personnel during operating hours. The tower provides for the monitoring and coordination of waterfront activities and water craft. Two-way radios will assist in communication and coordination of activities and to assure a safe environment for campers and staff. Additionally, staff located in the control tower will monitor the lifeguards on duty in swim areas and also orchestrate the routes of the boats for optimum safety. This process and procedure is successfully being used by all three of the existing camp sites operated by YMCA Camp High Harbour Services. There will be clearly marked swim areas and boating areas for safety purposes.

Q. Some commenters have provided photographs of long lines and traffic jams that occurred at other Camp High Harbors while parents parked and waited for YMCA to open on drop-off day. Please address the comment, describing how you would prevent the problem from occurring. Note that the issue is somewhat different from other traffic concerns, since the problem relates more to parked vehicles blocking the roadway, than to the number of vehicles using the road over a period of time.

A. These conditions will not occur at a YMCA camp at Bethel Park. The photos displayed on opposition websites and were taken at the YMCA camp located in the North Georgian

mountains near Clayton GA where the terrain does not allow for overflow parking areas as does the terrain of Bethel Park.

The YMCA has carefully studied existing traffic and parking conditions of its other camping locations. For instance, YMCA day camping operations at Eagle Pointe in Cumming, Ga include enrollments of at least 185 children per day and require approximately 20 staff members. During the summer of 2007, we monitored traffic flow and found that more than 140 cars entered and exited the grounds each day. Although there are several subdivisions and numerous homes within the immediate vicinity of Eagle Pointe, according to the Corps of Engineer staff at the Lake Lanier office, there has been no significant level of public complaints from area residents. At no time were any residences blocked by YMCA traffic.

Similarly, YMCA programs offered at the Cherokee Outdoor YMCA at Lake Alatoona also have no significant traffic impact on area roads and neighborhoods. Enrollments at YMCA facilities on Lake Allatoona are much larger than those at Eagle Pointe, with 460 campers per day as well as 60 staff. Our findings demonstrate that well over 300 cars per day enter and exit YMCA facilities located off Bells Ferry Road – a two-lane rural road – in Woodstock, Ga, with no notable traffic congestion. In addition, the YMCA also offers a large youth soccer and tee-ball program at this location. More than 700 cars enter and exit this facility on Saturdays during the spring and fall seasons, however, no traffic light or traffic officer is required.

Based on our findings and experience at the Eagle point and Cherokee County locations, it is our belief that traffic and congestion concerns raised by residents near Bethel Park have no validity. A YMCA Camp at Bethel Park will increase traffic flow only on Saturdays and Sundays during the 10-week summer camp program period. Traffic impact will not exceed actual experiences at the locations previously mentioned.

Within the YMCA master plan for Bethel Park, two parking areas have been established. Parking area “H” will hold at least 156 spaces. An additional overflow parking area, “H1”, will hold at least 48 spaces. The plan will allow for at least 204 parking spaces, more than adequate to address this concern. The YMCA master plan includes approximately .6 miles of interior roadways. Assuming 22 feet per car, approximately 200 additional cars may park curbside. There is no reason to believe that any cars will ever park outside the entry of the YMCA camp facilities.

Additionally, traffic will be managed by staging arrival times for campers. In summary, no backup of traffic will occur.

Q. A concern was raised that your proposed sewage treatment plan will not meet Forsyth County requirements. Please describe how you will comply with the County law and/or regulation.

A. The YMCA through the use of professional engineers intends to fully comply with all requirements of the federal Clean Water Act (33 U.S.C.A. § 1251 *et seq.*) and the Georgia Water Quality Control Act (O.C.G.A. § 12-5-20 *et seq.*) manifested in Georgia through the delegated issuance of waste-water facility permits by the Environmental Protection Division (EPD) of the Georgia Department of Natural Resources. The YMCA also fully intends to comply with all technical design requirements to which it may be subject by the EPD or by Forsyth County through the Standard Specifications for Water Distribution and Sanitary Sewer Systems as issued by the Forsyth County Water and Sewer Department (September 12, 2005 edition). At this point

the YMCA is unaware of any design deficiency contained in its submission to the Corps of Engineers.

Q. A commenter stated that bright lights used by the YMCA at night constitute a nighttime nuisance to the nearby neighborhood. Describe how you would manage this impact.

A. The YMCA is extremely aware of concerns related to light pollution. We are highly committed to ensuring that all lighting, regardless of location, shall be designed to prevent direct glare, light spillage, and hazardous interference with automotive, bicycle and pedestrian traffic on adjacent streets and adjacent properties.

Our design team has researched state-of-the art lighting systems and finds that over the last several years, lighting design and technologies have been developed to respond to such concerns regarding light pollution. The YMCA plan will include exterior pathway lighting which will be directed toward the ground. Any tall pole mounted lighting fixtures will be provided with cut-off shields to minimize glare and light spillage. Special lighting required for the main Camp Assembly Area during performances will be directed toward the performance area only. Except for low-level security lighting, the camp lighting will be automatically controlled to shut off no later than 11pm. Playing fields shall not be lit.

The following selected illumination goals will apply:

- Parking lots - 1 footcandle average on pavement
- Street lights will be located to achieve a minimum of .5 footcandles
- Walkways – min. 0.2 footcandles to a maximum of 1.2 footcandles and not exceeding 6:1 uniformity
- Building entrances – 5 footcandles
- Site entrance – 20 footcandles

The YMCA will also be open to local feedback to assure continued improvement on YMCA operating performance.

Q. A comment was received that the noise study was inadequate; that playing loud rock music did not constitute a scientific study. Please describe the methodology of the study relative to its professional acceptance as a bona fide noise study.

A. The YMCA conducted an extensive and comprehensive sound and noise pollution study. The YMCA utilized a reputable sound engineering firm that utilized scientific instrumentation to obtain data necessary to demonstrate no significant impact resulting from audible sound levels which may occur at the YMCA camp and retreat. Existing conditions from area Corps of Engineers RV parks and campgrounds were sampled. YMCA camp programs and noise conditions were actually simulated and measured. Below is a summary of our methodology and findings as outlined by Merck & Hill Consultants, Inc.

Public Address Simulation at Bethel Park: The methodology for assessing audibility of low-level sounds over distances is not standardized. However, studies of man-made noise impact in U.S. National Parks have used “audibility” or “percentage of time audible” by an observer while simultaneously taking sound level measurements as a factor in assessing visitor experience quality. This approach of actually observing and measuring real sound in the field is superior to prediction methods which must rely on *approximated* sound propagation, terrain, and foliage effects and is currently the best method for assessing low-level sound impact for a given

topographical setting. Further, numerical prediction methods are not as reliable as direct observations/measurements in determination of the audible *detectability* of low-level sounds over distances.

For this evaluation, a professional-grade, portable, public address sound system (PA) which was capable of producing equivalent sound levels and frequency response as the future PA planned for the Campfire Assembly areas was used. In fact, this P/A system is currently used by the YMCA for addressing groups at other locations. For accurate evaluation, the PA system was located at a position approximately at each of the Campfire assembly areas indicated in the YMCA's proposed development plan. The volume of the system was set to a *maximum* playback level (approximately 90 dBA measured at 50 feet). This would be at least equivalent and probably greater than typical playback levels for the Campfire Assembly areas (levels greater than that would generally be considered uncomfortably loud for assembly attendees). Using the same audio track for measurement consistency, we measured the sound levels along the property boundary of the park nearest to adjacent residential properties. The locations of the PA and measures were shown in a plan drawing of the proposed development. The measurements with the PA were compared to ambient background levels without the PA. The measurements were conducted with a professional "precision sound level meter" which meets the accuracy requirements of ANSI S1.4 for Type 1 and ANSI S1.11 for Type 1C classifications. As a matter of routine practice, field calibration checks were conducted prior to the series of measurements.

As noted in the previous study report, the PA system did not produce any measurable differences above ambient background levels at any of the measurement locations. Also, the detectability ranged from *completely inaudible* to "*just barely audible*". The term "*just barely audible*" meant that while the sound of the PA was faintly audible above the ambient background levels, the sound was not distinct *and*, importantly, no measurable difference was detected with the sound level meter. This procedure clearly and objectively demonstrates that the potential noise impact of future PA sounds from the Campfire Assembly areas would be insignificant.

Alternate Development Noise Impact: The method for assessing noise levels associated with the potential development of a public campground park facility involved continuous, unattended sound level monitoring to determine Day-Night Noise Levels (DNL). This is the accepted industry method for assessing noise impacts from existing sources over a full 24-hour period or longer. Measurements are preferred over prediction-of-impacts where source classification, sound levels, and source locations are variable or indeterminate such that predictions would be practically impossible and inaccurate. The DNL is the preferred standard metric for assessing noise impact under most Federal regulatory and non-regulatory guidelines and comparison of the measured DNL levels to these guidelines can provide a general basis for determining acceptability of noise environments. The monitoring was conducted with a special logging sound-level meter fitted with a weatherproofed microphone. The hourly data from this instrument was compiled into the standard 24-hour DNL which was previously reported for the two campgrounds.

Because the DNL metric is intended to encompass longer-term average levels, short-term "spot checks" of levels can be a helpful supplement for quantifying the range of transient sound events. In this case, measurements were made at several locations around the campgrounds to document noise levels occurring at the particular time and location. These measurements were the same type and were made with the same instrument used to assess the public address sound system at Bethel Park. Due to the watercraft in the vicinity of the campgrounds and nearby campground activity, all the measured levels were significantly greater than those for the PA measurements at Bethel Park.

The results of the two campground surveys indicated that ambient background levels were largely dominated by watercraft noise in the vicinity of these parks. Watercraft activity is, undoubtedly, more frequent in the vicinity of these developed camping parks and the associated noise from the nearby boating activities is correspondingly greater. On the other hand, the YMCA development proposal would restrict public boating access and would also control its own boating activities in the immediate vicinity of the park. As a result, watercraft-related noise impact under the YMCA proposal would also be limited compared to that of a developed public camping facility. Consequently, it was concluded that the proposed YMCA development would result in less noise from boating activities than other proposals to develop a public campground or popular day-use facility.

Measurement data are available upon request. Our complete study has previously been submitted by the YMCA.

Q. A concern was raised as to the restriction in use of the park to the general public, specifically to the use of the boat ramp and walking trails – that even with allowing times for the public to have access to the facilities, there would be conflicts between overlapping camper arrivals and public use.

A. Keeping kids safe is central to all future public use of a YMCA camp at Bethel Park. Just as many RV Parks and Campgrounds on Corps of Engineers properties on Lake Lanier limit public access when campgrounds are full, there will be periods of times when public access to Bethel Park will be restricted. The YMCA fully intends to accommodate existing usage by the local community. For example at our Lake Burton Site in north Georgia, local residents seeking to enjoy the campgrounds must simply stop at our office (our control access point) and check in with the camp staff. Visitors may be asked to wear a guest badge to identify themselves as an authorized visitor. Our camp staff will be alerted that a YMCA guest will be on site.

In the event that we have someone that does not check in at the camp office, all staff leadership and counselors are trained to present themselves to the visitor in a non-confrontational manner to determine the intent of the visitor and advise them of a need for a guest pass. All camp staff will be alerted via two way radio transmissions should an unauthorized visitor be on site. This practice is consistent with the regulations and standards of the American Camping Association and the YMCA's Safe Kids Policies and Procedures.

Upon receiving a lease from the Corps of Engineers, the YMCA would attempt, through face-to-face dialogue, to determine actual needs and use patterns of the local residents. A use schedule would be developed to accommodate interested parties. All YMCA public access practices must consider the safety of the youth campers and staff. Trails and picnic areas on Island III, found on the YMCA master plan, is an area suitable for public use during times made available. In that current use of Bethel Park is quite low, no major conflict is apparent.

The boat ramp at Bethel Park will not be open to anyone outside the YMCA for loading and unloading boats. The YMCA has committed to invest \$160,000 in the Corps of Engineers plan for improvements of Two Mile Creek boat launch facilities. This commitment shall include enhancements to existing conditions and the construction of an additional launch to offset the closure of the Bethel Park boat ramp. This improvement will provide for the needs of the general public.